

**APPENDIX A**  
**WILLIAM E. MCGEE CIVIL RIGHTS**  
**MOOT COURT COMPEITION**

**CRITERIA AND SCORESHEET FOR JUDGING BRIEFS**

**NOTE: Do not consider the merits of the case. Judge only the quality and organization of the arguments.**

<b>Brief ID Letter:</b> _	<b>Judge's Name:</b> _____	<b>SCORE</b>
---------------------------	----------------------------	--------------

**I. Quality of the Argument\* (40 Points)**  
\_\_\_\_\_/40 ponts

- A.** Issues before the Court correctly identified and persuasively articulated.
- B.** Effective “slanting” of the facts in the Statement of the Case.
- C.** Depth of legal research and appropriate reliance on applicable law. \_\_\_\_
- D.** References to leading cases, statutes, regulations, legislative history, and secondary authority.
- E.** Effort to distinguish unfavorable precedents.
- F.** Persuasiveness of arguments and soundness of legal reasoning.
- G.** Effective use of favorable facts from the record/ no use of adjudication facts outside of designated fact record.
- H.** Effective weaving of relevant facts, policy arguments, and applicable law.
- I.** Opposing arguments anticipated and addressed appropriately.

---

\*The subparagraphs listed below each grading topic are examples of the types of factors to consider in judging that area.

(see back for additional scoring criteria)

# Criteria and Score Sheet for Judging Briefs

Page 2

Brief ID Letter: \_\_\_\_\_ Judge's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

## II. Organization of the Brief (30 Points)

\_\_\_\_\_/30 Points \_\_\_\_\_ / 20 Points

- A. Logical and persuasive sequence of arguments. \_\_\_\_\_ / 10 Points
- B. Division of arguments by effective use of point headings.
- C. Inclusion of all relevant facts.
- D. Effective use of the 35-page space limitation imposed by the rules.
- E. All issues raised on appeal adequately addressed.
- F. Appropriate relief stated in the conclusion.

## III. Overall Writing Style (20 Points)

- A. Clarity and conciseness of legal analysis and expression.
- B. Proper use of grammar.
- C. Proper use of language suitable to a Supreme Court brief.

## IV. Technical Details\*\* (10 Points)

- A. Incidence of spelling and typographical errors.
- B. Incidence of grammar, mechanical or style errors.
- C. Incidence of bluebook citation errors.

**TOTAL BRIEF SCORE:** \_\_\_\_\_

---

\*\*A separate judge will check and grade margins, adherence to competition brief format rules. Brief judges are expected to give only their general impressions on these technical areas.