

APPENDIX A

WILLIAM E. McGEE CIVIL RIGHTS MOOT COURT COMPEITION

CRITERIA AND SCORESHEET FOR JUDGING BRIEFS

NOTE: Do not consider the merits of the case. Judge only the quality and organization of the arguments.

Brief ID Letter: _____ **Judge's Name:** _____

SCORE

I. Quality of the Argument* (40 Points) _____/40 Points

- A.** Issues before the Court correctly identified and persuasively articulated.
- B.** Effective “slanting” of the facts in the Statement of the Case.
- C.** Depth of legal research and appropriate reliance on applicable law.
- D.** References to leading cases, statutes, regulations, legislative history, and secondary authority.
- E.** Effort to distinguish unfavorable precedents.
- F.** Persuasiveness of arguments and soundness of legal reasoning.
- G.** Effective use of favorable facts from the record/ no use of adjudication facts outside of designated fact record.
- H.** Effective weaving of relevant facts, policy arguments, and applicable law.
- I.** Opposing arguments anticipated and addressed appropriately.

*The subparagraphs listed below each grading topic are examples of the types of factors to consider in judging that area.

(see back for additional scoring criteria)

Criteria and Score Sheet for Judging Briefs

Page 2

Brief ID Letter: _____ Judge's Name: _____

II. Organization of the Brief (30 Points) _____/ 30 Points

- A. Logical and persuasive sequence of arguments.
- B. Division of arguments by effective use of point headings.
- C. Inclusion of all relevant facts.
- D. Effective use of the 35-page space limitation imposed by the rules.
- E. All issues raised on appeal adequately addressed.
- F. Appropriate relief stated in the conclusion.

III. Overall Writing Style (20 Points) _____/ 20 Points

- A. Clarity and conciseness of legal analysis and expression.
- B. Proper use of grammar.
- C. Proper use of language suitable to a brief submitted to a Circuit Court.

IV. Technical Details** (10 Points) _____/ 10 Points

- A. Incidence of spelling and typographical errors.
- B. Incidence of grammar, mechanical or style errors.
- C. Incidence of bluebook citation errors.

TOTAL BRIEF SCORE: _____

**A separate judge will check and grade margins, adherence to competition brief format rules. Brief judges are expected to give only their general impressions on these technical areas.